

## **CFA STUDIES ON THE PLIGHT OF LOW- AND MODERATE-INCOME GOOD DRIVERS IN AFFORDING STATE-REQUIRED AUTO INSURANCE**

Over the past three years, Consumer Federation of America (CFA) has undertaken an effort to research the state of the auto insurance market in America with a particular focus on issues of access and affordability for lower- and middle-income Americans. This research project has included studies using a variety of data sources, including NAIC and ISO reports, company-specific rates by ZIP-code from a third party vendor, and systematic rate testing of individual insurance company websites.

As discussed below, the research addresses several different aspects of auto insurance rates, premiums and the market, but all point to a few key findings:

- The cost of state-mandated basic liability insurance is higher than many lower-income Americans can afford and the number of uninsured citizens in this category is higher than the national average as a result;
- Insurers use a variety of socio-economic rating factors that push premiums up for lower-income Americans despite good driving records; and
- Stronger state consumer protections related to auto insurance rate setting leads to greater access to and more stability in auto insurance markets.

Below is a short description of each of the reports that CFA has issued since 2012. This is followed by a summary of the key recommendations from the reports.

### [New Research Shows That Most Major Auto Insurers Vary Prices Considerably Depending on Marital Status](#)

*Consumer Federation of America (2015)*

(CFA) released research on how insurers utilize marital status in their pricing of auto insurance policies. CFA questions the fairness and relation to risk of this pricing by most major insurers, particularly their practice of hiking rates on women whose husbands die by 20% on average, the “widow penalty.”

### [Auto Insurers Fail to Reward Low Mileage Drivers](#)

*Consumer Federation of America (2015)*

(CFA) released research showing that large auto insurers frequently fail to reward drivers with low mileage despite a strong relationship between this mileage and insurance claims. The study found that three of the five largest insurers often give low-mileage drivers no break at all. In a 2012 nationwide survey conducted by ORC International for CFA, 61 percent of respondents said that it was fair for auto insurers to use mileage in pricing auto insurance.

[Large Auto Insurers Charge High Prices, to a Typical Lower-Income Safe Driver with Car Financing, for Minimal Coverage](#)

*Consumer Federation of America (2014)*

(CFA) found that annual auto insurance premiums are especially high for the estimated eight million low- and moderate-income drivers who finance their car purchases. These drivers must purchase the comprehensive and collision coverage required by auto lenders in addition to the liability coverage required by states. In the 15 cities CFA surveyed, annual premium quotes were almost always more than \$900 and were usually more than \$1,500.

In a related national opinion survey undertaken by ORC International for CFA, nearly four-fifths of respondents (79%) said that a fair annual cost for this auto insurance coverage was less than \$750. One-half (50%) said that a fair annual cost was less than \$500. Respondents were asked what they thought was a reasonable annual cost for a “30-year old woman with a modest income and ten years driving experience with no accidents or moving violations” for required liability, collision, and comprehensive insurance coverage.

[High Price of Mandatory Auto Insurance for Lower Income Households](#)

*Consumer Federation of America (2014)*

The country’s five largest auto insurance companies do not make a basic auto insurance policy available to typical safe drivers for less than \$500 per year in over 2,300 urban and suburban ZIP codes including 484, or more than a third, of the nation’s lowest-income ZIP codes. In the report, CFA analyzed 81,000 premium quotes for State Farm, Allstate, Farmers, Progressive, GEICO and each of their affiliates in all ZIP codes in 50 large urban regions, which include urban, suburban and adjacent rural communities. CFA also reviewed the premium quotes from an additional 58 insurance companies – comprising a total of 207 insurance affiliates including those of the five largest insurers - which produced similar results.

In 24 of the 50 urban regions, there was *at least one* lower-income ZIP code where annual premiums for a minimum limits policy exceeded \$500 from every major insurer. In nine of these 50 areas – Miami/Ft. Lauderdale, Detroit, Minneapolis/St. Paul, Tampa/St. Petersburg, Baltimore, Orlando, Jacksonville, Hartford, and New Orleans – prices exceeded \$500 in *all* lower-income ZIP codes.

This report included the finding from a recent national survey that more than three-quarters of Americans (76 percent) believe that a “fair annual cost” for state-mandated insurance for a typical good driver with no accidents and no tickets should be less than \$500.

### [Uninsured Drivers: A Societal Dilemma in Need of a Solution](#)

*Consumer Federation of America (2014)*

This report found that most uninsured drivers in America have low incomes and cannot afford to purchase the mandatory minimum liability coverage required by their state. The report also revealed that these low-income drivers are increasingly adversely impacted by state and local government actions, including raising liability requirements (driving up premiums), more rigorous enforcement, and stiffer penalties. However, there is little difference in uninsured rates between those states that penalize uninsured drivers harshly and those that do not. The report reviewed penalties for driving without auto insurance in every state and found some of these very harsh penalties for lower-income Americans who truly cannot afford the required insurance:

- Fourteen states allow jail sentences for a first offense,.
- Thirty-two states allow for the possibility of license suspension for a first offense.
- Thirty-three states have possible fines of \$500 or more for a first offense.

### [CFA Analysis Shows Auto Insurers Charge Higher Rates to Drivers with Less Education and Lower-Status Jobs](#)

*Consumer Federation of America (2013)*

Several major auto insurers place a heavy emphasis on their customers' occupation and education when setting prices, forcing lesser educated, blue collar workers with good driving records to pay substantially higher premiums than drivers with more education and higher paying jobs. For example:

- GEICO charges a good driver in Seattle 45% more if she is a factory worker with a high school degree than if she is a plant superintendent with a bachelor degree;
- Progressive charges the factory worker 33% more in Baltimore; and
- Liberty Mutual charges the worker 13% more in Houston.

The report also highlighted a national survey that found that about two-thirds of Americans believe that it is unfair to use education and occupation when pricing insurance policies.

### [What Works: A Review of Auto Insurance Rate Regulation in America and How Best Practices Save Billions of Dollars](#)

*Consumer Federation of America (2013)*

Over the past quarter century, auto insurance expenditures in America have increased by 43 percent on average and by as much as 108 percent. These increases occurred despite substantial gains in automobile safety and the arrival of several new players in the insurance markets. Only in California, where a 1988 ballot initiative transformed oversight of the industry and curtailed some of its most anti-consumer practices, did insurance prices fall during the period, resulting in more than \$4 billion in annual savings for California drivers.

This report used NAIC data to assess the impact of different types of insurance market oversight (prior approval, file and use, use and file, flex rating, and deregulation) on rates, industry profitability, and competition. It also provided a detailed analysis of California's experience with the nation's most consumer protective rules governing the auto insurance market.

[Largest Auto Insurers Frequently Charge Higher Premiums To Safe Drivers Than To Those Responsible For Accidents](#)

*Consumer Federation of America (2013)*

CFA analyzed premium quotes from the five largest auto insurers in twelve major cities and found that two-thirds of the time, insurers would charge a working class driver with a 45 day lapse in coverage and a perfect driving record more than companies charged an executive with no lapse in coverage but a recent at-fault accident on their record. In 60% of the tests, the lower-income good driver was charged at least 25% more than the higher-income driver who had caused an accident.

[Use of Credit Scores by Auto Insurers Adversely Impacts Low- and Moderate-Income Drivers](#)

*Consumer Federation of America (2013)*

Holding all other factors constant, the two largest auto insurers, State Farm and Allstate, charge moderate-income drivers with poor credit scores much higher prices than drivers with excellent scores. Using data purchased from a third party vendor of insurance rate information, this report showed that State Farm increased rates for the low credit score driver an average of 127 percent over the high credit score customer and Allstate raised rates by 39 percent, costing State Farm and Allstate customers an average of more than \$700 and \$350, respectively, based solely on credit scores.

The report also pointed to a recent national survey conducted for CFA that found that, by a greater than two to one ratio, Americans reject insurer use of credit scores in their pricing of auto insurance policies.

[Auto Insurers Charge High and Variable Rate for Minimum Coverage to Good Drivers from Moderate-Income Areas](#)

*Consumer Federation of America (2012)*

This report used extensive website testing to show that good drivers -- those with no accidents or moving violations -- who live in moderate-income areas in 15 cities were being quoted high auto insurance rates by major insurers for the minimum liability coverage required by those states. Over half (56%) of the rate quotes to two typical moderate-income drivers were over \$1000, and nearly one-third of the quotes (32%) exceeded \$1500.

The report also presents findings from a national survey that shows that lower-income families report knowing people who drive without insurance at a much higher rate than higher-income drivers. Further, nearly 80 percent of drivers agreed that "they [the uninsured drivers] do so because they need a car but can't afford the insurance."

### [Lower-income Households and the Auto Insurance Marketplace: Challenges and Opportunities](#)

*Consumer Federation of America (2012)*

Access to an automobile plays a critical role in creating economic opportunities for lower-income Americans and the affordability of auto insurance plays a key role in this access. This report provides an overview of the auto insurance market with a detailed discussion of low- and moderate-income (LMI) households' participation in the auto insurance market. The report summarizes pricing information collected by CFA as well as data related to availability, residual markets and uninsured motorists.

At the heart of this report, which was the first in the series of reports outlined above, is the finding that for millions of lower-income Americans auto insurance is unaffordable and inaccessible despite their unblemished driving records. High priced auto insurance, which often leads LMI drivers to choose between giving up their cars or driving uninsured, creates serious economic hardships, and the issue must be addressed by policymakers and regulators. The report concludes with a summary of the issues, obstacles and needs facing LMI customers and policy suggestions for addressing them.